

# MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held  
at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 2nd August, 2016 at 2.00 pm**

**PRESENT:** County Councillor R. Edwards (Chairman)  
County Councillor P. Clarke (Vice Chairman)

County Councillors: R. Chapman, D. Evans, R. Harris, B. Hayward,  
J. Higginson, P. Murphy, M. Powell, B. Strong, P. Watts, A. Webb  
and A. Wintle

## **OFFICERS IN ATTENDANCE:**

Philip Thomas	Development Services Manager
Robert Tranter	Head of Legal Services & Monitoring Officer
Mark Hand	Head of Planning, Housing and Place-Shaping
Paula Clarke	Planning Applications and Enforcement Manager
Shirley Wiggam	Senior Strategy & Policy Officer
Paula Harris	Democratic Services Officer

### **1. Apologies for Absence**

We received apologies from County Councillors D. Blakebrough, D. Dovey and D. Edwards.

### **2. Declarations of Interest**

County Councillor A. Webb declared a personal and prejudicial interest pursuant to the Members' Code of Conduct in respect of planning application DC/2016/00588 as she attended an event at the Racecourse in December 2015. She left the meeting taking no part in the discussion or voting thereon.

County Councillor A. Webb declared a personal and prejudicial interest pursuant to the Members' Code of Conduct in respect of planning application DC/2015/01336 as she has previously declared an interest in previous applications relating to this site due to being the subject of a number of complaints from the objectors.. She left the meeting taking no part in the discussion or voting thereon.

### **3. To confirm for accuracy the minutes of the previous meeting**

The minutes of the Planning Committee meeting dated 5<sup>th</sup> July 2016 were confirmed and signed by the Chairman.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held  
at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 2nd August, 2016 at 2.00 pm

#### 4. To consider the following Planning Application reports from the Chief Officer - Enterprise (copies attached)

##### 4.7. PLANNING APPLICATION - DC/2016/00588 - PROPOSED DEMOLITION OF NORTHERN SPECTATOR STAND AND ERECTION OF MULTI-PURPOSE BUILDING AND ASSOCIATED WORKS CHEPSTOW RACECOURSE, CHEPSTOW

We considered the report of the application which was recommended for approval subject to the 11 conditions, as outlined in the report. Late correspondence was also received in respect of this application.

St Arvans Community Councillor Jonathan Richards, attending the meeting by invitation of the Chair, outlined the following points:

- The Community Council did not have any objections in principle to the application.
- The objection is specifically in relation to the vehicle access proposed.
- There are two vehicle access strategy proposals set out in the traffic management report. The Community Council's objection relates directly to the 2<sup>nd</sup> element of proposed access which will require traffic crossing the A466.
- The most northerly gate is within a 50mph zone and the Community Council considers this dangerous without traffic control.
- The access from the A466 crossing the road will cut across a public footpath and cycle path which is regularly used.
- Concerned was raised regarding the increased frequency of use at the facility, with particular regard to car parking spaces. The Community Council have submitted written objections on this matter previously.
- The principle concern is the additional traffic crossing the A466 entering and exiting the car park, crossing across the footpath & cycle path. There have been incidents there previously as the visibility is poor both entering and exiting the car park.
- The Community Council are pleased to note that the Officer's report recommends the traffic management report but find that the proposed condition and the understanding of the issues raised does not fully address the Community Council's concerns.

The applicant's agent, Mr Steven Higgins, attending the meeting by invitation of the Chair outlined the following points:

- He accepted that the traffic management plan needed further work and that any additional requirements that were required would be addressed.

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held  
at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 2nd August, 2016 at 2.00 pm**

- The Kennel Club, who are helping to fund the development have requested use of this gate so that elderly visitors who are showing their dogs can bring their dogs in crates as close to the facilities as possible.
- The new facility will bring visual benefits with a purpose built modern facility which compliments the gently undulating landscape.
- The stand will form phase one of the improvements to the Racecourse.
- The facility will benefit the local community by adding another revenue source and will look to encourage local use.
- The proposed use will complement the offer of the Racecourse at times other than race days.
- On race days the new replacement stand will bring excellent facilities to the Racecourse and will be important in poor weather conditions.
- The objective is not to increase the number of visitors but to improve the experience of existing visitors.

Having considered the report of the application and the views expressed, Members considered that the proposed scheme was a good scheme which will offer improved facilities within the County.

It was therefore proposed by County Councillor P. Murphy and seconded by County Councillor R. Harris that application DC/2016/00588 be approved subject to the amendment to condition 5 as per late correspondence and add condition 12 requiring submission of a construction management plan, as requested by Highways.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval - 12

Against approval - 0

Abstentions - 0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2015/01136 be approved subject to the amendment to condition 5 as per late correspondence and add condition 12 requiring submission of a construction management plan, as requested by Highways.

#### **4.1. PLANNING APPLICATION - DC/2013/00474 - A FIRST FLOOR EXTENSION TO 5 & 5A CHIPPENHAMGATE STREET TO PROVIDE A SINGLE, ONE BEDROOM DWELLING WITH THREE PARKING SPACES AT GROUND LEVEL. 5 & 5A CHIPPENHAMGATE STREET, MONMOUTH NP25 3D**

This item was initially discussed at the July 2016 Planning Committee meeting where it was proposed by County Councillor A.M. Wintle and seconded by County Councillor

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 2nd August, 2016 at 2.00 pm

D.L.S. Dovey that consideration of application DC/2013/00474 be deferred to the August meeting to allow officers to liaise with the applicant with a view to changing the external wall and roof materials and that white render should be provided with a slate roof.

After a considering the amended plans, it was proposed by County Councillor A. Wintle and seconded by County Councillor R. Chapman that application DC/2013/00474 be approved subject to the amended plans, as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval - 13  
Against approval - 0  
Abstentions – 0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2013/00474 be approved subject to the amended plans, as outlined in the report.

#### **4.2. PLANNING APPLICATION - DC/2015/01336 - PROPOSED CHANGE OF USE TO THE STORAGE AND REPAIR OF LIGHT MOTOR VEHICLES. STORAGE AND REPAIR OF UP TO TWO HGV MOTOR VEHICLES AND A TRAILER AND ANCILLARY PARKING AREAS (REVISED SCHEME) LAND AND EXISTING WORKSHOPS, NEW BARN WORKSHOP SITE, ST ARVANS, CHEPSTOW, NP16 6HE**

The Head of Planning verbally reported an additional item of late correspondence which sought deferral of the item in the interests of 'natural justice' so that an objector could speak. The Planning Committee was advised that the request to speak was not made within the deadline set out in the Protocol.

In light of the late correspondence received shortly before the meeting, which was immediately distributed by the Planning Officers to the Members of the Planning Committee at the start of the meeting, the Chair granted a 10 minute pause in proceedings for Members to have further time to absorb the late correspondence before proceeding with this application.

We considered the report of the application which was recommended for approval subject to fifteen conditions, as outlined in the report. Late correspondence was also received in respect of this application.

In noting the detail of the application, Members expressed their appreciation of the concerns raised in regard to the application, both in terms of landscape and nuisance. A Member noted that there was no objection from the AONB office, provided screening was carried out and it was asked how we would be able to effectively monitor and maintain this. In response the Head of Planning advised the Committee that there was a condition recommended in the report for a management plan for the landscaping. The Development Management Team's Monitoring & Enforcement Officer would ensure that this

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 2nd August, 2016 at 2.00 pm

condition is complied with and maintained, and in the case the landscaping is not maintained or dies, there would be enforcement powers to take action if the planning application was granted.

We were also informed by the Head of Planning that there had been objections made in regard to the hours of operation of the repair garage not being enforced. But at present there are no planning conditions in place to enforce as the use is unauthorised.

A Member asked if the previous High Court Action in 2014 had been addressed. In answer we were told that the findings of the High Court in the 2014 case had been addressed by officers and that they had given proper consideration to the application received and presented to the Planning Committee today.

It was proposed by County Councillor P. Murphy and seconded by County Councillor M. Powell that application DC/2015/01336 be approved subject to amending condition 7 to refer to 'light' vehicles, amending condition 15 to ensure timber cladding is retained in perpetuity and Members noting that the Officers had carried out a revised environmental impact assessment in light of the otter hole feature.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval - 12  
Against approval - 0  
Abstentions – 0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that DC/2015/01336 be approved subject to amending condition 7 to refer to 'light' vehicles, amending condition 15 to ensure timber cladding is retained in perpetuity and Members noting that the Officers had carried out a revised environmental impact assessment in light of the otter hole feature.

#### **4.3. PLANNING APPLICATION - DC/2016/00320 - REMODELLING OF EXISTING DWELLING MALLARD AVENUE CALDICOT**

We considered the report of the application which was recommended for approval subject to the three conditions, as outlined in the report.

The local Member for Caldicot also a Planning Committee Member, expressed concerns regarding the application stating that he felt that the proposed roof was too high and that the remodelling would be out of character with the area.

Having considered the report of the application and the views expressed, it was proposed by County Councillor P. Murphy and seconded by County Councillor M. Powell that application DC/2016/00320 be approved subject to the three conditions, as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held  
at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 2nd August, 2016 at 2.00 pm**

For approval - 10  
Against approval - 3  
Abstentions – 0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2016/00320be approved subject to the three conditions, as outlined in the report.

**4.4. PLANNING APPLICATION - DC/2015/01585 - CONVERSION OF ORIGINAL HOUSE TO 6 APARTMENTS; CONVERSION OF COACH HOUSE AND STABLES INTO TWO SEPARATE RESIDENTIAL UNITS. DEMOLITION OF 1970'S EXTENSION BLOCK, ERECTION OF 36 NEW BUILD RESIDENTIAL UNITS (INCLUDING 10 AFFORDABLE RETIREMENT APARTMENTS AND 2 AFFORDABLE RETIREMENT BUNGALOWS) THE HILL, PEN-Y-POUND, ABERGAVENNY, NP7 7RP**

We considered the report of the application which was recommended for approval subject to the twenty conditions, as outlined in the report. Late correspondence had also been received in respect of this application.

The local Member for Abergavenny was not present, so the adjacent ward member, also a Planning Committee Member, expressed his support for the application.

Concern was raised by Members regarding the rear window sills for the Earlswood house type. The applicant who was present agreed verbally to provide them and officers will ensure the sills are shown on an amended plan before the decision is issued.

Having considered the report of the application and the views expressed by the local Member, it was proposed by County Councillor R. Harris and seconded by County Councillor M. Powell that application DC/2015/01585 be approved subject to the twenty conditions, as outlined in the report and subject to a S106 agreement, the addition of a Highway condition set out in late correspondence regarding future maintenance and management of the access, and biodiversity conditions referred to in late correspondence, as well as the amended plan showing the window sills on rear elevation of the Earlswood house type before issuing the decision..

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval - 13  
Against approval - 0  
Abstentions – 0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2015/01585 be approved subject to the twenty conditions, as outlined in the report and subject to a S106 agreement, the addition of a Highway condition set out in late correspondence regarding future maintenance and management of the access, and biodiversity conditions referred to in late

## MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL

### Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 2nd August, 2016 at 2.00 pm

correspondence, as well as the amended plan showing the window sills on rear elevation of the Earlswood house type before issuing the decision.

#### **4.5. PLANNING APPLICATION - DC/2016/00301 - PROPOSED CONVERSION OF REDUNDANT AGRICULTURAL BUILDING (BARN 4) INTO RESIDENTIAL USE FIVE LANES FARM, CAERWENT**

We considered the report of the application which was recommended for approval subject to the fourteen conditions, as outlined in the report.

The local Member for Caerwent, also a Planning Committee Member, expressed his support for the application.

In noting the detail of the application, it was proposed by County Councillor P. Murphy and seconded by County Councillor J. Higginson that application DC/2016/00301 be approved subject to the fourteen conditions, as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval - 13  
Against approval - 0  
Abstentions – 0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2016/00301 be approved subject to the fourteen conditions, as outlined in the report.

#### **4.6. PLANNING APPLICATION - DC/2016/00494 - CHANGE OF USE OF HOTEL WITH C1 USE TO A1, A2 AND A3 USE ON THE GROUND FLOOR WITH B1 USE TO THE FIRST AND SECOND FLOORS. THE SWAN HOTEL, CROSS STREET, ABERGAVENNY, NP7 5ER**

This item was initially discussed at the July 2016 Planning Committee meeting where it was proposed by County Councillor D. Edwards and seconded by County Councillor M. Powell that consideration of application DC/2016/00494 be deferred to the August meeting to allow Abergavenny Town Council's Planning Committee time to consider the application and to submit comments to Monmouthshire County Council's Planning Department.

In noting the detail of the application, it was proposed by County Councillor P. Clarke and seconded by County Councillor R. Chapman that application DC/2016/00494 be approved subject to the four conditions, as outlined in the report.

Upon being put to the vote, the following votes were recorded:

For approval - 13

## **MONMOUTHSHIRE COUNTY COUNCIL**

**Minutes of the meeting of Planning Committee held  
at County Hall, The Rhadyr, Usk, NP15 1GA on Tuesday, 2nd August, 2016 at 2.00 pm**

Against approval - 0  
Abstentions – 0

The proposition was carried.

We resolved that application DC/2016/00494 be approved subject to the four conditions, as outlined in the report.

### **5. FOR INFORMATION - The Planning Inspectorate - Appeals Decisions Received**

#### **5.1. The Mount, Parc Road, Coed y Paen, Monmouthshire NP4 0SY**

We received the Planning Inspectorate report which related to an appeal decision following a site visit on 14th June 2016, site The Mount, Parc Road, Coed y Paen, Monmouthshire NP4 0SY.

The appeal had been dismissed.

#### **5.2. Appeals received - 24th June - 21st July 2016**

We noted the appeals received between 24<sup>th</sup> June and 21<sup>st</sup> July 2016.

The Head of Planning, Housing and Place-Shaping informed the Committee that a date that been sent to Committee members for the next design tour, Wednesday 14<sup>th</sup> September 2016 and asked for suggestions from Members of places they would like to visit.

We were informed that prior to the October Planning Committee meeting we would receive a visit from the Chief Planning Inspector who will be giving a brief presentation regarding developments of national significance.

There will be a joint officers and member session of training on the morning of the 17<sup>th</sup> November 2016 for the Design Commission for Wales with a view to further training in 2017, details to follow.

On Tuesday 27<sup>th</sup> September 2016 at 1pm there is a meeting of the Economy and Development Select Committee to which members of the Planning Committee are invited to look at the annual performance report and the LDP annual monitoring report.

**The meeting ended at 3.45 pm**